

Outcomes used in Modern Slavery and Human Trafficking Interventions



A Rapid Review of Quantitative Studies



Introduction



The aim of the Modern Slavery Core Outcome Set Project is to identify priority outcomes to be reported across interventions that aim to support the recovery, healing and reintegration of survivors of modern slavery.

We know that survivors of modern slavery experience serious and long-term health, social, and economic consequences. But, high quality evidence is lacking about how policies and services can intervene effectively to support recovery, healing and reintegration. Comparing the effectiveness of interventions requires that the measurement of outcomes is standardised. Yet currently, there is no consensus on the definition and measurement of recovery, healing or reintegration outcomes for survivors of human trafficking and modern slavery. Building a consensus is vital. The development of a Modern Slavery Core Outcome Set (MS-COS) will enable this, providing a minimum set of standard and measurable outcomes that should be reported across interventions that aim to support survivor recovery, healing and reintegration.

In order to develop the MS-COS, our project has two phases. The first phase is generative in nature, generating a long list of outcomes and sorting these into a taxonomy or schema. To do this we have undertaken rapid reviews of the literature, analysed secondary qualitative data, collected primary data, and run two stakeholder workshops. This short report outlines our findings from the first rapid review undertaken.

What we did

We wanted to know what outcomes are used and measured by interventions working with people who have experienced human trafficking. To answer this question, we searched for all other reviews on the topic and used these to find the relevant papers to include in our review. We included 11 reviews and, from these, found 46 potentially useful studies.

After going through all 46 studies, only 8 studies had information relevant to our aim.

For this review, we were only interested in quantitative studies – studies that measured outcomes using numbers. Reviews since 2011 were included if they covered academic intervention studies working with adults who had experienced human trafficking.

Studies Included

This table summarises the characteristics of each of the **8 studies** we included in our review, including the **outcomes assessed** in these studies.

LEAD AUTHOR	YEAR	STUDY COUNTRY	SAMPLE	OUTCOMES ASSESSED
Shareck	2020	Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 100 – 120 women est. • all experience of sex trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Health • Addiction • Housing • Legal issues • Social support networks • Education and employment.
George	2020	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5 men and 31 women • mainly experience of sex trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Physical and mental health (e.g., PTSD, hepatitis C, pelvic pain, depression)
Cerny	2019	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 8 women • all experience of sex trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meaningful activities • Task behaviours (e.g., decision making, problem-solving) • Executive functioning skills (e.g., planning, initiating) • Occupational performance.
Magnum	2019	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15 women • all experience of sex trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sensory modulation (e.g., self-regulation of emotions, self-esteem, resilience) • Basic functions (e.g., cooking, using the telephone) • Executive functions • Occupational performance.
Munsey	2018	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 11 women • all experience of sex trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Depression • PTSD • Self-esteem
Robjant	2017	United Kingdom	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 10 women • all experience of sex trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PTSD • Distress
Ostrowschi	2011	Moldova	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 120 women • mainly experience of sex trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Psychiatric diagnosis (PTSD, depression)
Potocky	2010	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6 undocumented migrant men and 37 women • experience of sex and labour trafficking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shelter/food • Immigration issues • Mental health • Social and emotional health • English language ability • Employment/education

What we found

Most of the studies were conducted in North America

Five studies took place in the United States and one Canada. Two were conducted in Europe; one in Moldova (Cerny et al. 2019) and one in the UK (Robjant et al. 2017). There appears to be a geographical gap in intervention research, with no studies meeting the inclusion criteria in Asia, Africa, South America or Australasia. Though we accepted only English language studies and this may have excluded some studies from these countries.

Only three studies reported any country-of-origin data.

Only the George 2020, Ostrovschi et al. 2011, Potocky 2010 studies reported country of origin data, a worrying trend given the influence of nationality on important migrant experiences such as the asylum process (see Jannesari et al. 2020).

From the 240 participants, only 11 were men. No studies stated that they worked with non-binary people.

All the studies focussed on sex trafficking, with only two (Ostrovschi et al. 2011, Potocky 2010) including other forms of trafficking such as labour exploitation.

Half of all the studies focussed on diagnosable mental health outcomes.

The Munsey et al. 2018, Robjant et al. 2017, Ostrovschi et al. 2011, George et al. 2010 studies all focussed on diagnosable mental health outcomes, particularly Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD). These were measured using standardised mental health tools such as the Post-traumatic Diagnostic Scale (Foa et al. 1997) and the Hamilton Depression Rating Scale (Hamilton 1960). Two studies (Magnum et al. 2019, Cerny et al. 2019) used the Canadian Occupational Performance Measure 'designed to capture a client's self-perception of performance in everyday living, over time', including 'self-care, leisure and productivity' (COPM 2021). Two studies (Shareck et al. 2020, Potocky 2010) used NGO developed measures that looked at a broad set of outcomes including items on housing, social health, employment, and legal/immigration issues.

How we are using these findings

Outcomes identified in the rapid review have been fed into a master list of outcomes from the other review, interviews, and our exploratory workshops. This master list of outcomes provides the foundation for the e-Delphi exercise where stakeholders will vote on a core outcomes set.

This rapid review identified a skew in the literature towards North America and Europe, as well as a lack of male participants. We have addressed this issue in our project by conducting supplementary interviews with male and gender non-conforming survivors of human trafficking, and by identifying international partners from Asia and Africa to participate in the e-Delphi consensus exercise.



**MODERN SLAVERY
CORE OUTCOME SET**

References



- Potocky, M. (2010). Effectiveness of services for victims of international human trafficking: An exploratory evaluation. *Journal of Immigrant & Refugee Studies*, 8(4), 359–385.
- Ostrovschi, N. V., Prince, M. J., Zimmerman, C., Hotineanu, M. A., Gorceag, L. T., Gorceag, V. I., ... & Abas, M. A. (2011). Women in post-trafficking services in Moldova: diagnostic interviews over two time periods to assess returning women's mental health. *BMC Public Health*, 11(1), 1–9.
- George, J. S., Malik, S., Symes, S., Caralis, P., Newport, D. J., Godur, A., ... & Potter, J. E. (2020). Trafficking healthcare resources and intra-disciplinary victim services and education (THRIVE) clinic: a multidisciplinary one-stop shop model of healthcare for survivors of human trafficking. *Journal of Human Trafficking*, 6(1), 50–60.
- Cerny, S., Maassen, A., & Crook, K. (2019). Occupational therapy intervention for survivors of human trafficking. *Occupational Therapy in Mental Health*, 35(3), 287–299.
- Mangum, S. W., Doucet, B. M., Blanchard, M., & Alig, K. (2019). Survivors of sex trafficking: Occupation-based intervention for executive functioning. *Occupational Therapy in Mental Health*, 35(3), 300–313.
- Munsey, S., Miller, H. E., & Rugg, T. (2018). GenerateHope: A comprehensive treatment model for sex-trafficked women. *Journal of evidence-informed social work*, 15(4), 420–431.
- Shareck, M., Buhariwala, P., Hassan, M., & O'Campo, P. (2020). Helping women transition out of sex work: study protocol of a mixed-methods process and outcome evaluation of a sex work exiting program. *BMC women's health*, 20(1), 1–9.
- Robjant, K., Roberts, J., & Katona, C. (2017). Treating posttraumatic stress disorder in female victims of trafficking using narrative exposure therapy: A retrospective audit. *Frontiers in psychiatry*, 8, 63.

We thank you for your ongoing support of the MS COS Project

Acknowledgements

We are indebted to the valuable contributions of the people who have worked tirelessly on the Modern Slavery Core Outcomes Set Project since 2021. In particular, thank you to all survivors who have contributed to shaping and guiding this project.

The Modern Slavery Core Outcome Set Project team includes:
Sharli Anne Paphitis, Sohail Jannessari, Olivia Triantafillou, Marzena Zdrojkowska & Sian Oram (King's College London)
Bee Damara & Minh Dang (Survivor Alliance)
Rachel Witkin & Cornelius Katona (Helen Bamber Foundation)
Nicola Wright (University of Nottingham)
Emma Howarth (University of East London)

Additional King's College London student involvement:
Anitta Sritharan

This project is funded by the Modern Slavery and Human Rights Policy and Evidence Centre (the Modern Slavery PEC). The Centre is funded and actively supported by the UK Arts and Humanities Research Council (AHRC) on behalf of UK Research and Innovation (UKRI), from the Strategic Priorities Fund.



The views expressed in this report are those of the authors and not necessarily of the Modern Slavery and Human Rights Policy and Evidence Centre.